**Hossam Aly** 

# Free Precession in Undriven Warped Discs: a Cautionary Tale

Collaborators: Carolin (Lina) Kimmig, Rebecca Nealon, Callum Fairbairn, Giuseppe Lodato, Sijme-Jan Paardekooper, Ian Rabago



## Advantages of doing warps in SPH

No preferred directions: Discs would align with the mesh in grid codes

#### No need to worry about boundary conditions

Excellent conservation properties

Galilean invariance: solution unaffected by adding a large mean velocity

Automatic adaption for free: Higher resolution where there's more mass

#### Warped Disk Evolution in Grid-Based Simulations

C. N. Kimmig  $\mathbb{O}^1$  and C. P. Dullemond  $\mathbb{O}^1$ 



#### Warped Disk Evolution in Grid-Based Simulations



C. N. Kimmig  $\mathbb{O}^1$  and C. P. Dullemond  $\mathbb{O}^1$ 

#### Warped Disk Evolution in Grid-Based Simulations



C. N. Kimmig  $\mathbb{O}^1$  and C. P. Dullemond  $\mathbb{O}^1$ 





# **Reproducible with SPH?**

$$N = 5 \times 10^5$$



## **Reproducible with SPH?**

 $N = 5 \times 10^5$ 

 $N = 4 \times 10^6$ 



## **Reproducible with SPH?**





### What causes the precession?

Linear theory equations: Lubow & Ogilvie 2000

$$\Sigma_{g} R^{2} \Omega_{g} \frac{\partial \boldsymbol{l}_{g}}{\partial t} = \frac{1}{R} \frac{\partial \boldsymbol{G}}{\partial R} + \boldsymbol{\Omega}_{p} \times \boldsymbol{L}_{g}$$

$$\frac{\partial \boldsymbol{G}}{\partial t} + \frac{\Omega_{\rm g}^2 - \kappa^2}{2\Omega_{\rm g}} \boldsymbol{l}_{\rm g} \times \boldsymbol{G} + \alpha \Omega_{\rm g} \boldsymbol{G} = \frac{\Sigma_{\rm g} H^2 R^3 \Omega_{\rm g}^3}{4} \frac{\partial \boldsymbol{l}_{\rm g}}{\partial R},$$

 $\Omega_{\rm g} = \Omega_{\rm k} \sqrt{1-\mu}$ 

Reproducible in 1D? Non-linear interaction?

## **Take Home Messages**

• We miss things if we don't try the same problem with different codes

• Effective viscosity floor is probably at the alpha~0.01 level